Charter School Board Minutes November 18, 2004 USOE, Board Room

Attending: Brian Allen, David Moss, Anne Peterson, Scott Smith, Sonia Zisumbo, Patricia Bradley, Ray Timothy, Jo Schmitt

Guests: Steve Winitzky, Janene Bowen, Royce VanTassell, Lisa Putman, Matt Throckmorton, Larissa Powell, Katy Holt-Larsen, Deena Pyle, David Purinton, Carolyn Sharette, Roberta Hardy, Murat Ozoglu, Jed Stevenson, Glenn Wa, Dan Gray

Scott Smith moved approval of the October 21, 2004 minutes. Sonia Zisumbo seconded the motion. Minutes were accepted as presented.

There was discussion over the issue of founding preference.

Allen commented that it is difficult to schools identify a number of founding member slots and what it entails to merit founding member status. Peterson commented that Utah's allowance of up to 20% seems high. Moss reminded the board that the state board rule is clear and it defines founders as persons involved in the development of the application. Allen commented that much work remains after the charter is granted and we artificially limit the volunteer potential with the way the State Rule currently reads. Smith commented that because founder preference is high sought after, there needs to be a way to ensure against abuse. That might be achieved by stating the number of slots that will be held and clearly defining the criteria. Board agreed that the practice of seeking founding status on multiple charter applications needs to be resolved and discouraged. David Purinton from the audience suggested that the state might in the future look into an open-ended preference for persons who volunteer significantly. Allen commented that the current state and federal laws don't currently allow for that. Larissa Powell from the audience spoke in favor of capping this preference with a number that is the same for all schools regardless of size.

Zisumbo moved that the State School Board grant a waiver of R-277-470 Section (4)(C)(1) (the provision calling for applicants to include a certified list of founding members and the criteria used to establish the founding status) on the condition that the schools grant status to no more than 20% of the school's enrollment and that the list be provided to the Charter School Office by August 20, 2004. Peterson seconded the motion and the motion passed.

Board heard information about the funding for the Charter Schools Office. They discussed some revisions to the proposed rfp for a comprehensive evaluation of charter schools. Smith moved that the board recommend the office proceed with preparing and distributing the rfp for evaluation as amended. Moss seconded. Motion passed.

The board looked at the Utah Foundation proposal to conduct a follow up study of their 2003 report on Utah charter schools. Allen moved to defer action on the proposal, Smith seconded the motion and the motion passed.

Board looked at the Agreement that the State Board has used with Charter Schools it approved. Bradley directed board to the input provided by both Bill Evans of the Attorney General's Office and Richard Evans. Board directed staff to extend and invitation to both Richard and Bill Evans to attend the December Charter School Board meeting and discuss their recommendations, including those regarding 501C-3 status. Board would like to also have comments from Carol Lear. Allen asked the representatives of the Charter Schools Association to direct any comments on the Agreement to him via email.

Ainsling Preparatory Academy. Scott Smith moved that the board approve.\_ vote, motion failed, applicant denied recommendation. (No votes – Bobbie Killpack, David Moss, Anne Peterson, Sonia Zisumbo)

American Achievement Academy. Brian Allen moved that the board delay the vote on American Achievement and ask American Achievement to present information on November 30 provided a more completely defined secondary curriculum and the feasibility of and possible plan to phase the school in over a period of time. Scott Smith Seconded and the motion passed 5/0.

American Preparatory Academy-West. Scott Smith moved that the board approve. 4/3 vote, motion passed, applicant approved for recommendation. (No votes – Bobbie Killpack, David Moss and Sonia Zisumbo)

Beehive Science & Technology Academy. Anne Peterson moved to approve. 6/1 vote, motion passed, applicant approved for recommendation. (Bobbie Killpack)

Carden Traditional. David Moss moved that the board deny. 7/0 vote, motion passed, applicant denied.

Independence Academy. Anne Peterson moved that the board deny. 7/0 vote, motion passed, applicant denied.

Linber Pine Academy has withdrawn their application.

Lincoln Academy. David Moss voted that the board approve. 7/0 vote, motion passed, applicant approved for recommendation.

Mt. Nebo Academy has withdrawn their application.

North Star Academy. David Moss moved that the approve. 7/0 vote, motion passed, applicant approved for recommendation.

Odyssey Charter School. Sonia Zisumbo moved that the board approve. 7/0 vote, motion passed, applicant approved for recommendation.

Paradigm High. Scott Smith moved that the board deny. 7/0 vote, motion passed, applicant denied.

Pinnacle High School. Brian Scott moved that the Board defer their vote on this application and ask the applicant to provide information he will request on November 30<sup>th</sup>.

4/1 vote, motion passed. (Anne Peterson no)

Ronald Reagan Academy. Sonia Zisumbo moved that the board approve. 5/2 vote, motion passed, applicant approved for recommendation. (David Moss and Anne Peterson no) Sterling Academy. Applicant withdrew application.

Syracuse Arts Academy. David Moss moved that the board deny. 7/0 vote, motion passed, application denied.

Thomas Edison-South. Brian Allen moved to defer the vote and request that the applicant provide information about how many students would transfer from the north campus, if there would still be a viable enrollment at TECS and what the current enrollment of the school is.

Anne Peterson amended the motion to include that the applicant would also need to provide assurance and evidence that they could fully implement the core curriculum in their first year and not phase it in over three years. 5/0 vote, motion passed.

Utah County Academy of Science. Anne Peterson moved that the board approve. 7/0 vote, motion passed, application approved for recommendation.

Wasatch Peak Academy. Davis Moss moved that the board deny. Allen offered substitute motion that the board approve. 5/2 vote, motion passed, application approved. (David Moss and Anne Peterson no)

Allen cautioned that the applications that have been approved may be notified that their applications need to be revised in certain areas. Applicants who were denied were encouraged to continue working with the office and the Charter School Board. Allen commented that there was much merit in many of the applications. Some were simply not ready to proceed toward a fall opening and this was also influenced by the resources available to assist them at this time.

Peterson reminded the board that she is not available on November 30 and requested that all applicants who have further information to provide do so electronically so that she can receive it.

Peterson moved the meeting adjourn. Smith seconded the motion. Meeting adjourned at 1:00.

Meeting scheduled for November 30, 2004 Next regularly scheduled meeting December 16, 2004